# EXHIBIT A

# Civil Court of the City of New York

**County of New York** 

DAVID BROWN

Plaintiff(s)

-against-

CITIBANK N,A,; CENLAR DBA CITIBANK; CITIMORTGAGE INC.

Defendant(s)

Index Number: CV-020069-24/NY

SUMMONS WITH ENDORSED COMPLAINT

BASIS OF VENUE: Plaintiff's residence

Plaintiff's Address (s):
DAVID BROWN
720 FORT WASHINGTON AVENUE
UNIT 6-D
New York, NY 10040

To the named defendant (s)

CITIBANK N,A,, at 1000 TECHNOLOGY DRIVE, O Fallon, MO 63368-2240 CENLAR DBA CITIBANK, at 1000 TECHNOLOGY DRIVE, O Fallon, MO 63368-2240 CITIMORTGAGE INC., at 1000 TECHNOLOGY DRIVE, O Fallon, MO 63368-2240

YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to appear in the Civil Court of the City of New York, County of New York at the office of the Clerk of the said Court at 111 Centre Street in the County of New York, City and State of New York, within the time provided by law as noted below and to file your answer to the (endorsed summons) (annexed complaint) \* with the Clerk; upon your failure to answer, judgment will be taken against you for the total sum of \$50,000.00 and interest as detailed below. Plaintiff's work sheet may be attached for additional information if deemed necessary by the clerk.

Date:November 19, 2024

Tanya Faye, Acting Chief Clerk

ENDORSED COMPLAINT

The nature and the substance of the plaintiff's cause of action is as follows: Failure to provide proper services for \$50,000.00 with interest from 03/12/2024

BREACH OF CONTRACT. LOSS OF PROPERTY. FAILURE TO RETURN MONEY. DEFENDANTS FORCED PLAINTIFF TO PAY FOR PRIVATE MORTGAGE INSURANCE UNJUSTLY. RESULTING IN FINANCIAL HARM AND IN VIOLATION OF FEDERAL AND STATE LAWS. -PLEASE SEE ATTACHED COMPLAINT.

#### \*NOTE TO THE DEFENDANT

A) If the summons is served by its delivery to you personally within the City of New York, you must appear and answer within TWENTY days after such service; or

B) If the summons is served by delivery to any person other than you personally, or is served outside the City of New York, or by publication, or by any means other than personal delivery to you within the City of New York, you are allowed THIRTY days after the proof of service thereof is filed with the Clerk of this Court within which to appear and answer.

C) Following CPLR 321(a) corporations must be represented by an attorney.

\* NOTE TO THE SERVER OF THE SUMMONS

The person who serves the summons should complete the Affidavit of Service and shall file it in the Clerk's Office in the county where the action is brought.

PLAINTIFF'S CERTIFICATION

(See 22NYCRR, Section 130-1.1a)

SIGN NAME:

PRINT NAME:

DAVID BROWN

For Information, answer forms and to track court dates, go to WWW.NYCOURTS.GOV/NYCCIVIL

Case 1:25-cv-00238-JHR-OTW Document 1-1 Filed 01/10/27 9 Page 3 of 24

# NEW YORK CITY CIVIL COURT THE CIVIL COURT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

(Court Level and Jurisdiction)

David Brown	
	(Case I.D. Number)

**Plaintiff** 

-VS-

Citibank, N.A., Central Loan Administration & Reporting ("CENLAR"), CitiMortgage, Inc.

**Defendants** 

Complaint

## AFFIDAVIT

- I, David Ruben Brown, of New York City, in New York County (Manhattan) County, New York, MAKE OATH AND SAY THAT:
- On or about August 4, 2021, I received a Collateral Valuation Summary from Citibank, N.A. stating the property at 720 Fort Washington Avenue 6D, New York, New York 10040 received an Automated Valuation Model (AVM) Value Estimate of \$694,800. The Collateral Valuation Summary is attached and is marked as "Exhibit A: Collateral Valuation Summary".
- On August 20, 2021, I entered into a mortgage agreement with Citibank N.A. for 720 Fort Washington Avenue 6D, New York, New York 10040. Included in the Closing Disclosure was agreement to pay a monthly Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) in the amount of \$73.35. The Closing Disclosure is attached and marked as "Exhibit B: Closing Disclosure".

- Case 1:25-cv-00238-JHR-OTW Document 1-1 Filed 01/10/25 Page 4 of 24
- 3. On or about October 1, 2021, I received notification from Citibank N.A. that Central Loan Administration & Reporting ("CENLAR") would be servicing my mortgage and Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) payments.
- 4. I have maintained a good payment history and made early principal payments to qualify for Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) Removal in accordance with the Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance. The Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance is attached and marked as "Exhibit C: Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance"
- 5. On or about March 1, 2024, I made a request to CENLAR for Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) Removal in accordance with the agreed upon terms set forth in the Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance. The Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance is attached and marked as "Exhibit C: Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance".
- 6. On or about March 7, 2024, I received a letter from CENLAR acknowledging my request for Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) Removal. The March 7, 2024, letter is attached and marked as "Exhibit D: First Request for PMI Removal".
- 7. On or about March 12, 2024, I received a letter from CENLAR stating the Automated Valuation Model (AVM) Value Estimate is no longer available. Moreover, I would need to pay for an appraisal in the amount of \$450 or a Broker Price Opinion (BPO) in the amount of \$190 in order to be eligible for PMI Removal. The March 12, 2024, letter is attached and marked as "Exhibits E.1-E.2: Response to First Request for PMI Removal".
- 8. On or about June 1, 2024, I made a second request for Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) Removal in accordance with the Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance. The Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance is attached and marked as "Exhibit C: Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance"
- On or about June 14, 2024, I received acknowledgement from CENLAR of my second request for PMI Removal. The June 14, 2024, letter is attached and marked as "Exhibit F: Second Request for PMI Removal"
- On or about June 18, 2024, I received a letter from CENLAR stating the Automated Valuation Model (AVM) Value Estimate is no longer available. Moreover, I would need to pay for an

Case 1:25-cv-00238-JHR-OTW Document 1-1 Filed 01/10/25 Page 5 of 24 appraisal in the amount of \$450 or a Broker Price Opinion (BPO) in the amount of \$190 in order to be eligible for PMI Removal. The June 18, 2024, letter is attached and marked as "Exhibits G.1-G.2: Response to Second Request for PMI Removal".

- On or about June 22, 2024, I submitted a Broker Price Opinion to CENLAR in accordance with its June 18, 2024, letter. The Broker Price Opinion (BPO) is attached and marked as "Exhibit H: Broker Price Opinion (BPO)".
- 12. On or about June 25, 2024, I received a response to the Broker Price Opinion (BPO) from Jesus Alvarez that CENLAR's Mortgage Insurance department cannot accept a valuation ordered or conducted by the borrower. The Response to BPO is attached and marked as "Exhibit I: Response to BPO".
- 13. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Homeowner's Protection Act (HPA), Termination of PMI provision, requiring Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) be terminated once the homeowner's equity reaches 22% of the original property value (based on the original amortization schedule) or 20% based on actual payments.
- 14. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Homeowner's Protection Act (HPA), Disclosure Requirements provision, requiring disclosures to the homeowner regarding PMI, including initial disclosures at closing and annual reminders about PMI termination rights.
- 15. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Federal Trade Commission Act (FTCA), Unfair and Deceptive Practices provision, by failing to remove the Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) requirement.
- 16. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Truth in Lending Act (TILA), ensuring that consumers receive written disclosures about terms of credit agreements and the cost of borrowing.
- 17. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Real Estate Settlement Procedures Act (RESPA) provision protecting consumers during the home buying and loan process, particularly regarding the nature and costs of the real estate settlement process.
- Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated New York State Law, specifically, mortgage and banking regulations, including proper disclosure and handling of PMI.

- Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated New York General Business Law, prohibiting deceptive acts and practices in consumer transactions.
- 20. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Real Estate Settlement Procedures Act (RESPA) by failing to adequately respond to my Qualified Written Request (QWR) regarding PMI Removal in a timely and complete manner. Exhibits F through I detail multiple instances where my requests were either improperly handled or ignored, in violation of 12 U.S.C. § 2605(e).
- 21. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. violated the Homeowners Protection Act (HPA) by failing to terminate my PMI upon my request, despite meeting the necessary loan-to-value ratio criteria for automatic PMI removal. The exhibits show a refusal to remove PMI without proper justification, which is inconsistent with federal mandates under 12 U.S.C. § 4902.
- 22. Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc. engaged in deceptive acts and practices in the conduct of mortgage servicing. The communication regarding PMI removal was misleading and not in accordance with New York's consumer protection statutes, General Business Law (GBL) § 349 as outlined in Exhibits D through G.
- 23. Exhibit D shows my first formal request for PMI removal, which was ignored by CENLAR.
- 24. Exhibits E.1 and E.2 demonstrate incomplete and evasive responses from CENLAR, which provided no valid reason for their refusal to remove PMI.
- 25. Exhibits G.1 and G.2 reveal a pattern of CENLAR denying my requests, despite the Broker Price Opinion (Exhibit H) indicating the property value had sufficiently appreciated to meet PMI removal standards.
- 26. On or about October 17, 2024 I received my Annual Escrow Account Disclosure Statement from CENLAR which inaccurately reported a shortage in my escrow account in the amount of \$219.44. The Annual Escrow Account Disclosure Statement is attached and marked as "Exhibit J1-J5: Notice of Escrow Shortage".
- 27. As a direct result of Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc.'s violations, I have been forced to continue paying for PMI unjustly, resulting in financial harm. The company's failure to comply with both federal and state laws has caused undue stress, financial burden, and uncertainty regarding the status of my mortgage.
- 28. I request the following relief: 1) Immediate removal of the PMI from my loan and reimbursement for all PMI payments made beyond the appropriate termination date. 2) Damages for financial losses incurred due to Citibank N.A., CENLAR and CitiMortgage, Inc.'s unlawful conduct. 3) Any other relief deemed appropriate by the court.

STATE OF NEW YORK

COUNTY OF NEW YORK COUNTY (MANHATTAN)

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO BEFORE

ME, on the 18

(Signature)

David R. Brown

(Seal)

Signature

NOTARY PUBLIC

My Commission expires:

MANUEL A. DELACRUZ Notary Public, State of New York No. 01DE6035103

Qualified in New York County Commission Expires December 27, 20, 25

Page 5 of 5

#### **Exhibit List**

- 1. Exhibit A: Collateral Valuation Summary
- 2. Exhibit B: Closing Disclosure
- 3. Exhibit C: Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance
- 4. Exhibit D: First Request for PMI Removal
- 5. Exhibit E.1: Response to First Request for PMI Removal
- 6. Exhibit E.2: Response to First Request for PMI Removal
- 7. Exhibit F: Second Request for PMI Removal
- 8. Exhibit G.1: Response to Second Request for PMI Removal
- 9. Exhibit G.2: Response to Second Request for PMI Removal
- 10. Exhibit H: Broker Price Opinion (BPO)
- 11. Exhibit I: Response to BPO
- 12. Exhibit J.1: Notice of Escrow Shortage
- 13. Exhibit J.2: Notice of Escrow Shortage
- 14. Exhibit J.3: Notice of Escrow Shortage
- 15. Exhibit J.4: Notice of Escrow Shortage
- 16. Exhibit J.5: Notice of Escrow Shortage

## **COLLATERAL VALUATION SUMMARY**



Date: 08/04/2021

Brown, David R 1770 Grand Concourse 6e. Bronx, NY 10457

Re: 720 Fort Washington Avenue 6D, New York, NY 10040

Lender: Citibanic N.A. 1000 Technology Drive O'Fallon, MO 63368-2240

In analyzing your eligibility for a mortgage loan, an automated property valuation service provided an estimate of the property's value. This estimate is intended to be used solely by Citibank as part of the review of the appraisal.

On 06/07/2021 we received an Automated Valuation Model value estimate of \$694,800.

This estimate of value was developed by proprietary automated valuation methodology that was made available to Citibank by a third party vendor. This estimate of value is not the result of an appraisal, nor was it developed by a state licensed or certified appraiser. Neither Citibank nor the vendor makes any representations or warranties, express or implied, regarding the property, the condition of the property, or the estimated value of the property. Citibank did not use this estimated property value to make the credit decision on your mortgage loan application. If you have concerns, please contact your original Sales or Processing Representative for help in resolving the issue.

Sincerely,

Citibank, N.A.

**Enclosure** 

You are not responsible for any fees related to this report.

losing information	Transac	Son Information	Loan infor	coffee
into tearnal 05/19/2029 Bedry Date 65/20/2021 Schwetzfewit Base 65/20/2021 officeret Aprilla (Calingari, Aprilla 1	Barquer	1770 Grand Commune to Secon, NY 10162	Less Teas	ao yenin
84 0 0000/1988/2 720 Feet 1-84/89 60, New York, 17 30 Price \$346,006/80		Charge Zweler SELTAGE ME Brand, State 203, Grant Mack, NY 1021 Chilaga, N.A.	Loss ID	Conventional () FH
ceta ferins		METHOD AND AUTOMAL IN	AND THE PROPERTY OF THE	
Long Amount	\$463,250	Com this amount formuse	after closing?	
LOSII PAROUE	\$403,230	NO		
Interest Rate	2.75%	NO		
Monthly Principal & Interest See Projected Propuncts palso for year Editorial Total Healthy Popularit	\$1,891.18	МО		10. <del>9</del> (1) 11
Propayment Penalty		Does the loan have these	leature?	SS School (
Balloon Payment  Projection Daymounts		NO		
		NO		5-00 7 7 3 3 3 3 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5
Proceed & Interest		NO (sect 14 / )		
Principal & Interest Montpole Insurance Enterest Control Control  Principal & Interest		NO 81,691.10 73.35		
Principal & Interest  Markette Transporter  Esterated Excrete  Account can be present over time		NO (sect 14 / )	\$1,8	
Principal & Interest Montpole Insurance Enterest Control	•	NO 81,691.10 73.35	\$1,8	91.18 
Principal Calculation  Principal & Interest  Markship Insurance Estimated Entrop  Areasol can (streets over fine) Estimated Total Markship Payment	\$1,	NO  Secta (-4.)  \$1,891.19  73.35  0.00  ,964.53	\$1,8 •	91.18 
Principal & Interest  Symmet Collection  Principal & Interest  Marketon Insurance Estimated Engrow Amount can ignorance over time Estimated Total Monthly Payment	\$1,074.07	NO  St. 251.18  73.35 0.00 ,964.53  This estimate lactacles:    Property lease   Homeowork reserves	\$1,8 •	01.18 
Principal Calculation Principal & Interest  Markego Insurance Estimated Eurow Amount can promise over tipe	\$1,	NO  91,891.19  78.35 0.00  964.53  Title estimate incindes	\$1,89	01.18 0.00 1.18 In eactrow
Principal & Interest Psyment Colosiando Principal & Interest Markgoph Insurance Estimated Europe Amend on Assession over time Estimated Total Monthly Psyment  Estimated Tapes, programs I Austensanceth Incorticop Insurance	\$1,074.07	NO  Secto 1-4  \$1,891.18  73.35  0.00  \$164.53  This estimate includes:    Properly have  El Homeswords belanance  El Other, HQA Dates.	\$1,89	01.18 0.00 1.18 In eactrow
Principal & Interest  Principal & Interest  Markgrap Insurance Esterated Engrow Amount on forman over time Esterated Total Monthly Payment  Esterated Total  Esterated	\$1,074.07 a month	NO  Secto 1-4  \$1,891.18  73.35  0.00  \$164.53  This estimate includes:    Properly have  El Homeswords belanance  El Other, HQA Dates.	\$1,89 \$1,89	000 1.18 In eacrow NO NO NO to the other property

# Notice to Borrower Regarding Private Mortgage Insurance

Lender

Citibank, N.A. 1000 Technology Drive O'Fallon, MO 63368-2240

Date: August 20, 2021

Borrower

David R. Brown 1770 Grand Compourse 6e Bronx, NY 10457

Loan Numbe



#### Disclosures for Fixed Rate Mortgages

Initial Amortization Schedule. Your initial amortization schedule is attached.

Cancellation Date. Your Cancellation Date is 05/01/2024.

You may request cancellation of your private mortgage insurance coverage on the Cancellation Date, in accordance with § 3(a) of the Homeowess's Protection Act (12 U.S.C. § 4902(a)). The Cancellation Date is the date on which the principal balance of your mortgage is first scheduled to reach 80% of the original value of the property securing the processes our your instagage is an accordance to result war or our me original value at an property sectaing the loan, based solely on the initial amortization schedule and irrespective of the outstanding balance for the moregage on that date. You may request cancellation earlier than the Cancellation Date, based on actual payments.

Requirements for Cancellation. Your private mortgage insurance shall be cancelled on the Cancellation Date under the following conditions:

- · You have submitted a written request to your mortgage loan servicer that cancellation be inhinted.
- · You have a good payment history and are current on your payments with respect to your mortgage.
- You have satisfied any requirements of the holder of the mortgage for (1) evidence that the value of the property securing the loan has not declined below the original value of the property, and (2) cordification that your equity in the property securing the loan is unencumbered by a subordinate fien.
- · You continue to use the property securing the loan as your principal residence.

Termination Date. Your Termination Date is 05/01/2025.

Subject to the requirements listed in the Requirements for Termination section, your montgage loss servicer most Susject to the requirements into an the requirements for reministion section, your mongage soun servicer must automatically terminate your private montage insurance on the Termination Date, in accordance with § 3(b) of the Homeomers Protection der (12 U.S.C. § 4902(b)). The Termination Date is the date on which the principal balance of your mortgage is first scheduled to reach 75% of the original value of the property securing the loan, based solely on the initial amortization schedules and irrespective of the original value of the mortgage on that date. If your private mortgage insurance is not otherwise cancelled or imminated as described above, your mortgage toan servicer will terminate it at the midpoint of the amortization period.

Requirements for Termination. Your private mortgage insurance shall be terminated under the following

- You are current on your payments. If you are not current on your payments on the Termination Date, termination will occur when you become current.
- You continue to use the property securing the loan as your principal residence.

High Risk Loans. There are exemptions to the right of cancellation or termination of your private mortgage insurance for certain high risk loans. These exemptions do not apply to your mortgage.

ENTROPISH & AZONA, CO.



March 07, 2024

Hours of Operation: Customer Service: Monday - Friday, 8:30 AM to 8:00 PM ET Collections Dept : Monday - Friday, 8:00 AM to 9:00 PM ET

David R Brown 720 Fort Washington Ave 6d New York NY 10040 3729

> Qualified Written Requests, notifications of error, or requests for information concerning your loan must be directed to: PO Box 77423, Ewing, NJ 08628

RE: Loan Number:
Property Address: Lo Fort Washington Ave
6D
New York NY 10040

#### Dear Customer:

Thank you for your request for Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) removal. At this time your LTV is 79.68%. We have reviewed your account and it has been determined that you have reached the LTOV (Loan to Original Value) requirement for PMI removal. The next step is a valuation must be completed through our offices using the investor of your loan, Fannie Mae's, valuation system to certify the original value of the property. This valuation is required by the investor and is used to verify that your property value has not decreased.

In many cases this valuation is an Automated Valuation Model (AVM) performed by FNMA which is at no cost to you. If the AVM results in approval of PMI removal, you will receive a letter in the mail regarding the cancellation of PMI on your account.

However, in some cases this valuation method is not available or does not reflect a sufficient value and an interior and exterior BPO or appraisal is required, at your expense. If a valuation at your expense is required in order to proceed with your PMI removal request, you will be notified accordingly of your options and where to send your payment. Please note, these valuations must be ordered through our offices and Fannie Mae's valuation system, no outside valuations will be accepted.

We appreciate the opportunity to service your loan.

Thank you.

PM215 003 4RP MO



March 12, 2024

Hours of Operation: Customer Service: Monday - Friday, 8:30 AM to 8:00 PM ET Collections Dept.: Monday - Friday, 8:00 AM to 9:00 PM ET

David R Brown 720 Fort Washington Ave 6d New York NY 10040 3729

> Qualified Written Requests, notifications of error, or requests for information concerning your loan must be directed to: PO Box 77423, Ewing, NJ 08628

RE: Loan Number:
Property Address: 720 Fort Washington Ave
6D
New York NY 10040

Dear Customer:

We are writing you in response to your recent request to remove Private Mortgage Insurance ('PMI') from your loan. Typically, your investor would accept an Automated Valuation Model ('AVM') for the property, which indicates the estimated market value to determine eligibility. Unfortunately, the estimated market value is not available at this time for this property to determine eligibility. If you wish to proceed with removal of PMI, you have the following options available:

1. Full Appraisal: An appraisal is completed by a licensed real estate appraiser. This valuation provides a value for a property using local market data, typically consisting of at least three (3) recent comparable sales with adjustments applied. An appraisal also includes an exterior and/or interior inspection and measurement to assess the condition of the property, with repair estimates when applicable, as well as to provide a sketch. Therefore, full appraisals typically have a moderate turn-around time. Cost: \$450.00 (the cost of the appraisal has been ordered)

-OR-

 Interior BPO: A BPO is a Broker Price Opinion completed by a licensed real estate agent in the local market. This valuation provides an opinion of price using local market data, typically consisting of

PM721 007 HML MO

Page 2

three (3) recent comparable sales and three (3) comparable active listings. A BPO is similar to an appraisal; however, the report is not as detailed as a full appraisal. An interior inspection may or may not be completed in the process of valuing the home and the BPO may not reflect a fully accurate value due to this; however, a BPO typically has a faster turn-around time. Cost: \$190.00 (the cost of the BPO is only an estimate. The actual cost can increase once the BPO has

If you wish to pursue an option listed above, please mail a check for the corresponding amount of your choice along with a request detailing the intended use for the funds to:

Central Loan Administration & Reporting Attn: PMI DRPT PO BOX 77412 Ewing, NJ 08628

Regardless of the option selected, in addition to the requirements stated above, you must also maintain a good payment history. A good payment history is defined as no payments made 30 or more days late in the last 12 months and no payments made 60 or more days late in the last 24 months.

Please be advised the information contained in this letter is only valid for thirty (30) calendar days, assuming the loan remains current. Following expiration of the 30-day period, a new request and subsequent review of the loan will be required.

We appreciate the opportunity to service your loan.

Thank you.

PM721 007 HML MO



June 14, 2024

Monte of Operation: Customer Service: Monday - Friday, 8:10 AM to 8:00 PM ET Collections Dept.: Monday - Friday, 8:00 AM to 9:00 PM ET

David R Brown 720 Fort Washington Ave 6d New York NY 10040 3729

> Chalified Written Requests, notifications of error, or requests for information concerning your loan must be directed to: PO Box 77423, Ewing, NJ 08628

RE: Loan Number:
Property Address: 720 Fort Washington Ave
6D
New York NY 10040

Dear Customer:

Thank you for your request for Private Mortgage Insurance (PMI) removal. At this time your LTV is 79.19%. We have reviewed your account and it has been determined that you have reached the LTOV (Loan to Original Value) requirement for PMI removal. The next step is a valuation must be completed through our offices using the investor of your loan, Fannie Mae's, valuation system to certify the original value of the property. This valuation is required by the investor and is used to verify that your property value has not decreased.

In many cases this valuation is an Automated Valuation Model (AVM) performed by FNMA which is at no cost to you. If the AVM results in approval of PMI removal, you will receive a letter in the mail regarding the cancellation of PMI on your account.

However, in some cases this valuation method is not available or does not reflect a sufficient value and an interior and exterior BPO or appraisal is required, at your expense. If a valuation at your expense is required in order to proceed with your PMI removal request, you will be notified accordingly of your options and where to send your payment. Please note, these valuations must be ordered through our offices and Fannie Mae's valuation system, no outside valuations will be accepted.

We appreciate the opportunity to service your loan.

Thank you.

PM215 003 4RP MO



June 18, 2024

House of Operation: Charamer Service: Monday - Friday, 8:30 AM to 8:00 PM ET Collections Dept.: Monday - Friday, 8:00 AM to 9:00 PM ET

David R Brown 720 Fort Washington Ave 6d New York NY 10040 3729

> Qualified Written Requests, notifications of error, or requests for information concerning your loan must be directed to: PO Box 77423, Ewing, NJ 08628

RB: Loan Number:

Property Address: 720 Fort Washington Ave

6D New York NY 10040

Dear Customer:

We are writing you in response to your recent request to remove Private Mortgage Insurance ('PMI') from your loan. Typically, your investor would accept an Automated Valuation Model ('AVM') for the property, which indicates the estimated market value to determine eligibility. Unfortunately, the estimated market value is not available at this time for this property to determine eligibility. If you wish to proceed with removal of PMI, you have the following options available:

1. Full Appraisal: An appraisal is completed by a licensed real estate appraiser. This valuation provides a value for a property using local market data, typically consisting of at least three (3) recent comparable sales with adjustments applied. An appraisal also includes an exterior and/or interior inspection and measurement to assess the condition of the property, with repair estimates when applicable, as well as to provide a sketch. Therefore, full appraisals typically have a moderate turn-around time. Cost: \$450.00 (the cost of the appraisal is only an estimate. The actual cost can increase once the appraisal has been ordered)

-OR-

 Interior BPO: A BPO is a Broker Price Opinion completed by a licensed real estate agent in the local market. This valuation provides an opinion of price using local market data, typically consisting of

PM721 009 HML NO

Page 2

three (3) recent comparable sales and three (3) comparable active listings. A BPO is similar to an appraisal; however, the report is not as detailed as a full appraisal. An interior inspection may or may not be completed in the process of valuing the home and the BPO may not reflect a fully accurate value due to this; however, a BPO typically has a faster turn-around time. Cost: \$190.00 (the cost of the BPO is only an estimate. The actual cost can increase once the BPO has been ordered)

If you wish to pursue an option listed above, please mail a check for the corresponding amount of your choice along with a request detailing the intended use for the funds to:

Central Loan Administration & Reporting Attn: PMI DEPT PO BOX 77412 Ewing, NJ 08628

Regardless of the option selected, in addition to the requirements stated above, you must also maintain a good payment history. A good payment history is defined as when the loan is current, there are no payments made 30 or more days late in the last 12 months, and no payments made 60 or more days

We appreciate the opportunity to service your loan.

Thank you.

PM721 009 HML MO



## PIERS PORTFOLIO

June 22, 2024 **David Brown** 720 Fort Washington Ave #6D New York, NY, 10040

Dear Mr Brown.

Per your request I was asked to compile a Broker's Price Opinion (BPO) for the property located at 720 Fort Washington Avenue, Apartment #6D, New York, NY, 10040. By way of background, I am a Licensed Real Estate Salesperson at Compass and have over six years of experience in the residential sales market.

Based on the current condition and true comparable sales for this property, it is my opinion that this property has a current market value in the range of \$545,000-\$565,000.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any further questions.

Best.

Piers Portfolio

Piers Portfolio Licensed Real Estate Salesperson piers.portfolio@compass.com 201-739-6344

Document 1-1

Filed 01/10/25

LO/25 Page 19 of 24 Exhibit I: Response to BPO

Topic PMI Loan #

Jesus Alvarez 06/25/2024 12:49:36 PM EDT

Dear David R Brown,

Thank you for your recent email regarding your loan.

Please be advised that our Mortgage Insurance department cannot accept a valuation ordered or conducted by the borrower. Please follow the previous instructions to send payment for a new valuation ordered through our office.

If you wish to make the payment over the phone instead of by mail, please call our customer service department at 855-839-6253.

If you have a question and would like to speak with a representative, you can initiate a Chat session by Live Chat or send a secure message by selecting Ask a Question.

Thank you for giving us an opportunity to be of service to you. Sincerely,

Jesus A.

E-Mail Representative

Persons who are deaf, hard of hearing, or have limited speech may did TTY 711.

PO Box 77404 Ewing, NJ 08628

0-836-DWM10-0020928-001-000-000-000-000 DAVID R BROWN 720 FORT WASHINGTON AVE APT 6D NEW YORK NY 10040-3729

## YOUR ESCROW ACCOUNT HAS A SHORTAGE

10/17/2024

LOAN NUMBER:

Each year, we perform an analysis of your escrow account to ensure that there are enough funds to meet the required minimum balance to pay your projected taxes and insurance premiums. If there are not enough funds in your escrow account to do so, it is considered to have a shortage. Your escrow account has a shortage in the amount of \$219.44,

## What are my options?



**Take No Action and Pay Over Time** 

Your shortage of \$219.44 will automatically be divided evenly over your next 12 mortgage payments.

Starting December 01, 2024, your new monthly mortgage payment amount will be \$1,946.15.



Pay the Shortage in Full

You can choose to pay your full shortage amount of \$219.44.

Starting December 01, 2024, your new monthly mortgage payment amount will be \$1,927.86.

**AUTOPAY HOMEOWNERS:** If you have elected for us to deduct your monthly payment from your checking or savings account, we will automatically update the payment amount for you.

ONLINE BILL PAY HOMEOWNERS: If you make your monthly payment through an online bill pay service, please do not forget to update your payment amount.

If you would like to pay the shortage now:



OR



MAIL

Mail a check with the coupon below.

loanadministration.com

- Select "Payment."
- Choose "Make an Additional Payment."
- Enter shortage amount of \$219.44 on the "Additional Escrow" line to make your escrow payment.
- ▶ Agree to Terms and Conditions and "Confirm Payment."

DAVID R BROWN 720 FORT WASHINGTON AVE APT 6D NEW YORK NY 10040-3729



LOAN NUMBER

SHORTAGE AMOUNT

4788199802

\$219.44

If you choose to pay your escrow shortage of \$219.44 in full, your new loan payment amount will be \$1,927.86. Please include your loan number on your check. Make payable to Central Loan Administration & Reporting and send to:

PAYMENT PROCESSING CENTER PO Box 11733 Newark, NJ 07101-4733

## Case 1:25-cv-00238-JHR-OTW

Persons who are deaf, hard of hearing, or have limited speech may dial TTY 711.

PO Box 77404 Ewing, NJ 08628

0-836-DWM10-0020928-001-000-000-000-000 DAVID R BROWN 720 FORT WASHINGTON AVE APT 6D NEW YORK NY 10040-3729 Document 1-1 Filed 01/10/25 Page 21 Str 24 ANNUAL ESCROW ACCOUNT DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Property Address 7	20 FORT WASHINGTON AVE NEW YORK NY 10040
Statement Date	10/17/2024
Loan Number	4
New Mortgage Payment Ame	ount \$1,946.15
New Payment Effective Date	

#### Overview

Each year, we perform an analysis of your escrow account to ensure that there are enough funds to meet the required minimum balance to pay your projected taxes and insurance premiums. This Annual Escrow Account Disclosure Statement details our findings.

- Results of Our Analysis: You have a SHORTAGE. Your escrow account balance is 0 expected to fall below the required minimum balance.
- What This Means for You: Your shortage will be spread over 12 months and included in your monthly payment.
- Your Future Monthly Payment: Your payments will decrease, based on our escrow analysis projections for the next calendar year.

Your escrow account has a shortage in the amount of

**\$219.44** 

## Why do I have a shortage?

Below is a summary of your recent escrow activity. For more information about why your taxes or insurance premium adjusted, please contact your taxing authority or your insurance company.

For more details on how any insurance and/or tax adjustments will affect your future payments, please see the Escrow Account

#### **Annual Escrow Review**

Escrow Item	Expected to Pay	Change	Now Expect to Pay
MORTGAGE INSURANCE	\$880.20	•	\$440.10
TOTAL DISBURSEMENTS	\$880.20	•	\$440.10

### **Monthly Payment Comparison**

Payment Itemization	Current 11/01/2024	New 12/01/2024
Principal and Interest	\$1,891.18	\$1,891.18
Escrow Deposit	\$73.35	\$36.68
Escrow Shortage		\$18.29
Total Payment	\$1,964,53	\$1 946 15

## How was my shortage determined?

A shortage occurs when your lowest projected escrow balance is less than your required minimum balance. This is determined by simply subtracting the Required Minimum Balance from the lowest Projected Escrow Balance, as highlighted in the Escrow Account Projections section.

Your required minimum balance is determined by federal law, state law and your loan contract and includes a payment cushion of up to two months of escrow payments to help cover any increase in taxes and/or insurance.

Your current payment cushion is \$0.00.

REQUIRED MINIMUM BALANCE Balance 05/2025

\$0.00

**ESCROW SHORTAGE** 

\$219.44

MO

## **Escrow Account History**

This section is the actual activity that occurred from 10/2023 through 11/2023. It represents the period of time between the last analysis statement date and the last analysis effective date.

MONTH	Actual Escrow PAYMENTS	Actual Escrow DISBURSEMENTS		
			BEGINNING BALANCE	BALANCE
Nov 2023	\$73.35	\$73.35	PMI	\$0.52
		973.33	LIM	\$0.52

## Escrow account activity from December 2023 to November 2024

This section details your actual escrow account activity for the review period, which may help explain any changes to your payment. Over this period, an additional \$0.58 was deposited into your escrow account for interest on escrow.

Date	DEPOSITS TO		PAYMENTS FR	OM ESCROW	1	ESCROW BAI	ANCE
Date	Projected	Actual	Projected	Actual	Description	Projected	Actual
Dec 2023	\$73.35	670.00+			BEGINNING BALANCE	\$0.00	\$0.52
Dec 2023	9/3,33	\$72.95*	\$73.35		* PMI	1	\$73,47
Jan 2024	\$73.35			\$73.35	• PMI	7	\$0.12
Jan 2024	\$/3.35	\$73.35	\$73.35		* PMI		\$73.47
Feb 2024	670.05			\$73.35	• PMI		\$0.12
Feb 2024	\$73.35	\$73.35	\$73.35		* PMI		\$73.47
Mar 2024				\$73.35	* PMI		\$0.12
	\$73.35	\$146.84*	\$73.35		PMI		\$146.96
Mar 2024	(			\$73.35	• PMI		\$73.61
Apr 2024	\$73.35	•	\$73.35		PMI		V
Apr 2024		1		\$73.35	PMI		\$73.61
May 2024	\$73.35	\$73.35	\$73.35		PMI		\$0.26
May 2024		1		\$73.35	PMI		\$73.61
Jun 2024	\$73.35	\$73.50°	\$73.35		PMI		\$0.26
Jun 2024				\$73.35°			\$73.76
Jul 2024	\$73.35	\$73.35	\$73.35		PMI		\$0.41
Jul 2024				\$73.35	L		\$73.76
Aug 2024	\$73.35	\$263.35°	\$73.35		PMI		\$0.41
Aug 2024					ESC REFUND		\$263.76
Aug 2024				\$73.35			\$73.76
Sep 2024	\$73.35	\$73.52*	\$73.35	973.35			\$0.41
Sep 2024			Ų. U.UU	670 054	PMI		\$73.93
Oct 2024	\$73.35	\$73.35	\$73.35	\$73.35	- and a second s		\$0.58
Oct 2024			913.33	270.00	PMI		\$73.93
Nov 2024	\$73.35	\$73.35	\$73.35		PMI		\$0.58
estimate)	Constitution of the Consti	1.0.00	φευ.υυ	\$73.35	РМІ		\$0.58
Totals	\$880.20	\$1,070.26	\$880.20	\$1,070.20	Antonia di Santana anta anta anta anta anta anta a		Committee Street Street

An asterisk (\*) beside an amount indicates a difference from projected activity either in the amount or the date. Please note since mortgage insurance is paid monthly on the annual renewal date of the premium and PMI is paid monthly for the prior month's premium, additional asterisks report in the Account History for these items. if applicable.

The "estimate" under any of the dates indicates that the payment or disbursement has not yet occurred, but is estimated to occur as

Last year we anticipated that Disbursements would be made from your Escrow Account during the period equating \$880.20. Under Federal Law, your lowest monthly balance should not have exceeded -\$146.70, or 1/6th of total anticipated payments from the account, unless your loan contract or State law specifies a lower amount. Under your loan contract and State law your lowest monthly balance should not have exceeded \$0.00.

Your actual lowest monthly balance was greater than \$0.00. The items with an asterisk on your Account History may explain this. For a further explanation, call our Customer Service number shown at the end of this statement.

## Escrow Account Projections

This section provides an estimate of all payments we anticipate receiving as well as what we expect to pay on your behalf in the next year. The lowest projected balance and required minimum balance are highlighted for reference.

## Escrow account projections from December 2024 to November 2025

DATE	PAYMENTS TO ESCROW	WHAT WE EXPECT TO PAY	DESCRIPTION	PROJECTED ESCROW BALANCE	REQUIRED ESCROW BALANCE
D 0004			BEGINNING BALANCE	\$0.58	PROPERTY MENTAL PROPERTY CONTRACTOR PROPERTY AND ADMINISTRATION OF THE PARTY AND ADMINISTRATIO
Dec 2024	\$36.68	\$73.35	PMI		\$220.02
Jan 2025	\$36.68	\$73.35	PMI	-\$36.09	\$183.35
Feb 2025	\$36.68	\$73.35		-\$72.76	\$146.68
Mar 2025	\$36.68	\$73.35	PMI	-\$109.43	\$110.01
Apr 2025	\$36.68			-\$146.10	\$73.34
May 2025				-\$182.77	\$36.67
	\$36.68	\$73.35	PMI	-\$219.44	\$0.00
Jun 2025	\$36.68			The state of the s	30.00
Jul 2025	\$36.68			-\$182.76	\$36.68
Aug 2025	\$36.68			-\$146.08	\$73.36
Sep 2025	\$36.68			-\$109.40	\$110.04
Oct 2025	\$36.68			-\$72.72	\$146.72
Nov 2025	\$36.68			-\$36.04	\$183.40
TOTALS	\$440.16	\$440.10	where the property of the prop	\$0.64	\$220.08

## New Loan Payment

Your new payment		
consists of:	Principal & Interest (P & I)	\$1,891.18
	Escrow Deposit	\$36.68
THE RESIDENCE AND PARTY OF THE	Escrow Shortage	\$18.29
NEW LOAN PAYMENT	Beginning on December 01, 2024	\$1 946 4E

### **Customer Service**

loanadministration.com

Live Chat: Find all your loan information online. Still have questions? Use Live Chat on the website to speak with one of our representatives.

Correspondence

**Hours of Operation** 

Telephone

PO Box 77423 Ewing, NJ 08628

8:30 AM - 8:00 PM ET M-F

855-839-6253

We accept telecommunications relay service calls.

Ocument 1-1 Filed 01/10/25 Page 24 of 24 Document 1-1

YOUR ANNUAL ESCROW ACCOUNT DISCLOSURE STATEMENT LOAN NUMBER:

Persons who are deaf, hard of hearing, or have limited speech may dial TTY 711.

### Important Information

#### **AUTOPAY HOMEOWNERS**

If you're enrolled in Autopay, any additional principal deductions you have previously authorized are not included in the above listed new payment amount. However, until we are otherwise advised, the authorized additional principal amount will continue to be withdrawn from your account.

#### ADJUSTABLE RATE MORTGAGE CUSTOMERS

If your loan has an adjustable interest rate, your monthly principal and interest payment may change prior to your next Escrow

## INSURANCE RENEWAL/CHANGING INSURANCE

Upload proof of insurance coverage at www.mycoverageinfo.com/Cen300. Your insurance documents can also be sent to us via the following methods: Email: Cen300@mycoverageinfo.com or mail to: PO Box 202028, Florence, SC 29502-2028.

TO THE EXTENT YOUR OBLIGATION HAS BEEN DISCHARGED OR IS SUBJECT TO THE AUTOMATIC STAY IN A BANKRUPTCY PROCEEDING, THIS LOAN STATEMENT IS FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES ONLY AND DOES NOT CONSTITUTE A DEMAND FOR PAYMENT OR AN ATTEMPT TO COLLECT INDEBTEDNESS AS YOUR

New York Borrowers only - Please note that CitiMortgage, Inc. is registered with the Superintendent of the New York State Department of Financial Services. Complaints about CitiMortgage, Inc. may be submitted to the New York State Department of Financial Services. You may obtain further information from the New York State Department of Financial Services by calling the Department's Consumer Assistance Line at (800) 342-3736 or by visiting the Department's website at www.dfs.ny.gov.

New York mortgage customers: If your property is located in the state of New York, we are required to advise you of the following:

- (a) We are obligated to make all payments for taxes for which the real property tax escrow account is maintained and that if any such payments are not timely, we are responsible for making such payments including any penalties and
- (b) You are obligated to pay one-twelfth of the taxes each month, to be deposited into the real property tax escrow account, unless there is a deficiency or surplus in the account, in which case a greater or lesser amount may be
- (c) If required by law, we must deposit your escrow payments in a banking institution or a licensed branch of a foreign banking corporation whose deposits are insured by a federal agency; and
- (d) We cannot impose any fees relating to the maintenance of the real property tax escrow account.